



## **SPECIAL ELECTORS MEETING**

### **Minutes of the Special Electors Meeting Called to Discuss Mosquito Management in the Waterford Wetland and surrounding Areas Meeting Held in the Civic Hall on Tuesday 17 January 2012 commencing at 7.30pm**

#### **1. DECLARATION OF OPENING / ANNOUNCEMENT OF VISITORS**

The Mayor opened the meeting at 7.30pm and welcomed everyone in attendance. She then paid respect to the Noongar peoples, past and present, the traditional custodians of the land we are meeting on and acknowledged their deep feeling of attachment to country.

#### **2. RECORD OF ATTENDANCE / APOLOGIES**

Mayor Doherty (Chair)

##### Councillors:

V Lawrance	Civic Ward
G W Gleeson	Como Beach Ward
C Cala	McDougall Ward
R Grayden	Mill Point Ward
B Skinner	Mill Point Ward
F Reid	Moresby Ward

##### Officers:

Mr C Frewing	Chief Executive Officer
Ms V Lummer	Director Development and community Services
Mr P McQue	Manager Governance and Administration
Mr J Jenke	Environmental Health Services Coordinator
Mr E Bulli	Environmental Health Officer
Mr F Matthews	Environmental Health Officer
Ms M Coci	Administration Officer, Environmental Health
Ms G Hickson	Communications Officer
Ms G Nieuwendyk	Corporate Support Officer
Mr R Woodman	Corporate Projects Officer
Mrs K Russell	Minute Secretary

##### Guest Presenter

Dr P Neville	Acting Medical Entomologist, Department of Health, Western Australia
--------------	--

##### Apologies

Cr S Hawkins-Zeeb	Manning Ward approved Leave of Absence
Cr P Howat	McDougall Ward - approved Leave of Absence
Cr K Trent, RFD	Moresby Ward - approved Leave of Absence

##### Gallery

There were 141 members of the public present. Thirty-one written apologies received.

### STATEMENT FROM THE MAYOR

The Mayor requested that all mobile phones be turned off. She then advised that it was her intention to apply the City's Standing Orders Local Law to the running of the meeting and outlined the following points:

- Only electors can speak or vote at the meeting
- Councillors are not obliged to attend Electors' Meetings but have chosen to do so to listen to the comments made by the residents of South Perth. Councillors will not respond to any questions.
- Electors have the right to speak however any Councillor wishing to speak does so as an elector.
- Council is not bound by any decision made at the meeting. Motions passed will be considered by Council at the February 2012 Council meeting.
- Each speaker will be permitted 5 minutes and restrict their comments to the subject of the meeting.
- Speakers should not repeat comments / points already raised by another speaker. There will be the opportunity to voice support in the vote when any Motion is put.
- Meeting protocol to be adhered to.

### 3. **PETITIONS**

The Mayor read aloud the 'text' of the petition received on 20 December 2011 from Chris McMullen, 80 Elderfield Road, Waterford together with 137 signatures, as follows:

#### ***Text of the petition reads:***

*"We, the undersigned request a special meeting of electors to discuss Mosquito Management in the Waterford wetland and surrounding areas including:*

- *review of performance to date;*
- *summary of expert's recommendations and how they are to be implemented;*
- *alignment with residents' expectations of the City for its Mosquito Management Programme;*
- *and*
- *other issues raised by the meeting relating to the mosquito management."*

The Mayor then invited Mr McMullen to give his presentation. Mr McMullen responded by requesting that the City give the first presentation. The Mayor declined Mr McMullen's request and again invited him to commence his presentation. Mr McMullen requested that it be recorded in the Minutes that he did not wish to make his presentation first.

### 4. **PRESENTATIONS**

#### **4.1 Mosquito Management Plan - Goal / Aims / Objectives**

Mr McMullen, representing the Residents' Working Group gave a powerpoint presentation covering the following topics:

#### **- Some things went well**

- Initial responses and work with Working Group
- Publishing mozzie statistics
- Recognising the value of the Expert's report
- 'In the field discussions' between residents and City's field staff
- Ensuring Council had suitable policies in place to create an expectation of adequate mozzie control
- Councillor interest / engagement

MINUTES : SPECIAL ELECTORS CALLED TO DISCUSS MOSQUITO MANAGEMENT IN WATERFORD WETLANDS AND SURROUNDING AREAS : 17 JANUARY 2012

- **Goal**  
To reduce the numbers of nuisance or disease vector species to a level where the impact on the adjacent human populations is kept to an acceptable level.
- **Aims**
  1. To meet the requirements of Section IX of the *Health Act 1911* with respect to vector borne diseases; and
  2. 1. To meet the requirements of the residents adjacent to wetlands to have a reasonable quality of outdoor life.
- **City's Strategic Plan - 1. Community / Places**  
Create opportunities for a safe, active and connected community  
Direction 1.1 - Develop, review services...to meet changing community needs and priorities  
Direction 1.2 - Ensure service delivery aligns and responds to community safety priorities  
Direction 4.1- Identify/ensure community hubs are safe, vibrant and amenable  
Direction 4.3 - Engage community/develop a plan for activities and uses on and nr foreshore areas
- **City of South Perth Health Local Law 2002**  
Premises to be kept free of Mosquito Breeding Matter - clauses 83 and 90
- **Health Issues**  
*"Misery by Mozzies"* Southern Gazette newspaper 23 February 2010 - *"Waterford's summer mosquito plague resulted in a child twice needing medical treatment...."*  
  
Residents' health is now at risk / mosquito problem is intolerable. Listen to experts' advice
- **Comparative Trapping Results**  
City of Mandurah Mosquito Management Program data vs City of South Perth trapping data
- **Unreliable Information Used by City to make decisions....**  
Recording complaints  
Nuisance threshold  
Fogging and inversions / Fogging during daytime / safety  
Fogging for dusk biters  
"City doing all it can"  
Residents/ Survey
- **No Commitment to Action**  
We live near a wetland and Council has adopted Strategic Plans, policies, plans and laws that intend effective mozzie management  
Health Local Law  
Strategic Plan  
City Vision  
Health Act  
Mosquito Management Plan
- **Summary**  
The City:
  - did not achieve the aims of the Mosquito Management Plan
  - failed to adequately inform stakeholders
  - based its decision making on unreliable information and opinion
  - did not uphold its promised actions
  - has not responded with urgency to Expert's recommendations  
Residents' health is now at risk / mosquito problem is intolerable  
Listen to experts' advice  
  
Presentation concluded at 8.05pm

The Mayor invited the representative from the Department of Health to address the meeting.

#### **4.2 Mosquito Season 2011/2012 Review - Department of Health**

Dr Peter Neville, Acting Medical Entomologist, Environmental Health Hazards, Department of Health, Western Australia gave a powerpoint presentation on the following points:

- **El Nino vs La Nina**

El Nino/La Nina patterns are complex weather systems of heating or cooling of the Oceans. During El Nino periods, sea temperatures increase in the Pacific, cooling in the Indian ocean. we have droughts and hot dry weather across much of Australia. However, when the pattern swings to a La Nina year, we see increased rainfall, a drop in average daytime temperatures and an increase in cyclone activity. La Nina patterns are also associated with an increase in storm surges and high tides.

- **Impact of La Nina on storm surges and tides**

La Nina conditions lead to an increase in storm surges and high tides in Western Australia. Although City of South Perth are checking tides to determine risk of mosquitoes and treatment needs, we can also see that the predicted tides have been substantially lower than the actual tides (by 40-60cm). Thus, even using the best data on hand, we have not been able to predict when high tides may inundate low lying land.

- **Exceeding Max / Min Temperatures and Exceeding Min.Rainfall (Jan - March 2012)**

We have experienced above average temperatures throughout Spring and early Summer. However, we can see the forecast for the next three months indicates that maximum temperatures are not expected to exceed the average. However, minimum temperatures are expected to increase above average (around 65-70% of the norm) for the Perth Metro region. This means we will have warmer nights and water temperatures will not fluctuate as much. Thus, mosquitoes will be in a suitable habitat for development and will move through larval stage quicker under these conditions.

We have had above average rainfall in the Spring and early Summer periods allowing an increase in the number of potential freshwater habitats. This has ensured low lying areas have been filled with water allowing mosquitoes to breed. Also water has led to an increase in container breeding mosquitoes across many backyards.

- **Number of cases of Ross River Virus**

Total number of RRV cases fluctuates depending on environmental conditions, presence of virus, host animals and mosquitoes. Overall cases for WA has slightly declined since outbreak in 2008/2009. Perth Metro cases are slightly above average for 2011/2012 season, however, there is no clear pattern in occurrence of cases, being spread evenly throughout the suburbs. Cases for South Perth are very low and comparable to previous years.

- **Buffer Zones**

Research into use of buffer zones is essential to develop a case against the establishment of new developments and residential areas in close proximity to breeding sites.

There is no current legislation to ensure buffer zones are in place; but DoH tries to encourage developers and land managers to include buffers (up to 3km) from known breeding sites. This is done to protect future residents from mosquito-borne diseases.

- **Recommendations in Areas of High Concern:**

Titles on Deeds

Enclose outdoor entertainment/recreation areas

Inclusion of built form design

Promotion of residual barrier treatments

Precautions against mosquito bites

Presentation concluded at 8.20pm

## MINUTES : SPECIAL ELECTORS CALLED TO DISCUSS MOSQUITO MANAGEMENT IN WATERFORD WETLANDS AND SURROUNDING AREAS : 17 JANUARY 2012

The Mayor thanked Dr Neville for his presentation and advised the meeting that the CEO wished to comment on various issues raised.

The CEO said he wished to take the opportunity to respond to the last slide presented by the Petitioner, Chris McMullen, under the heading - "no commitment to action" as he believed it important to state what the City has done / and intends to do. He said that the Waterford Action Group would recall that whether it was by meeting, email or phone that there has been a joint effort to resolve this mosquito problem. The end result was a Management Plan that both the 'group' and the City of South Perth is happy with. He acknowledged that it may not be as successful as we would like, however to say there is no commitment and therefore no action is inaccurate and not true. Over the last two years we have conducted more larvicide and fogging than before and this has been communicated to the community on a monthly basis via statements in the Southern Gazette newspaper.

There is also a lot of information available on the City's website. A number of actions have recently been conducted, one of which was the independent survey ( which was not provided for in the current year's Budget) the results of which will be presented in the next presentation by the City's Environmental Health Services Coordinator. Some of the Consultant's recommendations we have already implemented and some are yet to be implemented as they require Council approval.

It is fair to say we have done a lot more over the last 2 years than ever before and we are always looking at ways to do better. He concluded by saying that he lived in the hills and that the mosquito nuisance was as much a problem there as in Waterford.

The Mayor invited the City's Environmental Health Services Coordinator to give his presentation.

### **4.3 City of South Perth Mosquito Management Plan**

Mr Jason Jenke, the City Environmental Health Services Coordinator gave a powerpoint presentation addressing the Consultant's 14 recommendations from the review as follows:

#### **Background**

- The City commenced mosquito management on the 26 August 2011 in accordance with the draft Mosquito Management Plan 2011/2012 .
- Council Resolved in August 2011 that:
  - (a) the City engage consultants to advise officers and take part in the development of the Mosquito Management Plan for 2011/12 in respect of the Canning River foreshore from Salter Point Lagoon to Cygnia Cove and adjacent suburbs; and
  - (b) the Brief for the consultants would include but not be limited to identifying all potential breeding sites, consider all treatment options and recommend the most appropriate actions to effectively manage the mosquito problem.

#### **Review**

- The City of South Perth commissioned Darryl McGinn, a Medical Entomologist and Managing Director of Mosquito Consulting Services, a Queensland based Company to undertake the review.
- The review was undertaken on 7 – 11 November 2011 with Council staff
- The review report completed by Mosquito Consulting Services 6 December 2011.
- The review report makes 14 recommendations.
- All recommendations are being considered and/or implemented by Council.
- Some recommendations have significant financial implications and/or require State Government approvals.

**Consultant's Review / Recommendations**

**Recommendations 1 and 2**

1. The major source of mosquito impact to residents of the CoSP is the salt-marsh mosquito breeding habitat as currently identified by Council, but also areas newly identified in November 2011 by CoSP and MCS.
2. Additional salt-marsh mosquito breeding habitat should be included within the Mosquito Management Plan.

**Wetland Areas / Known Breeding sites**

- Bodkin Park foreshore
- Elderfield Road

**Inspections and Larviciding**

*It is estimated that the City currently inspects and treats approximately 25% of the mosquito breeding areas due to inaccessibility.*

**Response: The City accepts Recommendations 1 and 2**

**Recommendations 3 and 4**

3. A high percentage of the identified salt-marsh mosquito breeding habitat should be included in Council's control program of application of larvicide.
4. Current inadequacies in effective larvicide application coverage, excessive foot traffic in sensitive salt-marsh habitat and high WPH&S (OSH) risk should be collectively addressed by introducing aerial application of mosquito larvicide
5. The preferred format for aerial application is to use S-methoprene pellets with an effective control life if not less than 28 days.
6. Reapplication of S-methoprene pellets should be in advance of the next likely salt-marsh flooding following not less than one month from the previous treatment (a month or more apart subject to likely flooding).

**Response:**

***Recommendations 3, 4, 5 & 6 require Council approval due to the cost implications***

**Recommendations 7 and 8**

7. Current ground based application of larvicide should be limited to areas untreated by aerial application.
8. Current ground based larvicide application equipment should be replaced with back-pack blower equipment to allow improved "stand-off" application and reduce foot traffic through sensitive salt-marsh.

**Response:**

***The City accepts Recommendations 7 and 8 pending Council approval due to cost implications.***

**Recommendation 9**

9. Current fogging operations should be modified as outlined in this report to minimise potential environmental impacts, improve effectiveness and community outcomes.  
Fogging operations include:
  - Wind speed, temperature inversion, wind direction and no rain, to all be considered.
  - Consider fogging from a suitable watercraft.

**Response:**

***The City accepts the first part of this recommendation as it reflects current practice. The second part of this recommendation is contrary to the chemical label requirements and written advice from DEC & SRT.***

MINUTES : SPECIAL ELECTORS CALLED TO DISCUSS MOSQUITO MANAGEMENT IN WATERFORD WETLANDS AND SURROUNDING AREAS : 17 JANUARY 2012

Recommendation 10

10. Introduction of residual insecticide barrier treatments should be considered in suitable public open space.

**Response:**

***Recommendation 10 requires Council approval due to the cost implications.***

Recommendation 11

11. Council may consider providing appropriate community advice on residual insecticide barrier treatments so that households may choose (at their cost, if they wish) to have such treatments applied within their home yards by commercial pest control operators.

**Response:**

***The City accepts recommendation 11 and will begin to promote this via the City's website.***

Recommendation 12

12. Council should consider forming a CLAG with adjoining Councils to achieve improved regional outcomes for coordinated mosquito control and avail themselves to shared funding opportunities with the State Government.

**Response:**

***The City has formally written to the City of Canning to begin this process. The next stage is for the Cities of Canning and South Perth to meet with the Department of Health – Feb 2012.***

Recommendation 13

13. The existing Mosquito Management Plan should be amended as Council sees fit to include the matters and recommendations of this report.

**Response:**

***The City accepts recommendation 13.***

Recommendation 14

14. Appropriate and specific in-service competency based training for Council's vector control officers should be developed and delivered to ensure local expertise is developed and provides long-term professional technical management of the program.

**Response:**

***City officers have completed Department of Health Mosquito Management training and will monitor options for ongoing training***

**What is the City Doing?**

- Larvicide treatments  
This season, the City has undertaken 18 larvicide treatments to date, compared to 8 treatments this time last season.
- Fogging  
This season, the City has undertaken 7 fogging treatments to date, compared to 3 treatments this time last season.

**Note:** This presentation will be made available on the City's website.  
Once updating is complete, the "City of South Perth Mosquito Management Plan 2011/2012" will be available on the City's website.

This presentation concluded at 8.40pm

#### 4. PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

The Mayor opened the Public Comment Period at 8.40pm and requested that speakers please state their name and address before making comment.

The following is a 'summary' of comments raised:

Adolf de Sousa, Waterford Avenue, Waterford - status of *draft* Mosquito Management Plan. In October 2010 we adopted a plan in *draft* - when finalised it had the support of the Working Group - pleased officers consulted with the primary stakeholders eg SRT, LGAs etc - now notice the latest plan has not been prepared with input from the *draft* plan - It was our understanding that the 2010/2011 document would be a 'learning document' and that the 2011/2012 Plan would learn from these experiences. The Mosquito Management Plan fails to use the most valuable resource to hand ie the people of Waterford - Council has publicised a misleading statement on its website.

CEO responded that the 2011/2012 Plan was in the process of being modified for the 2011/12 season when there was a Council decision made in August 2011 to appoint Consultants to review the mosquito problem. There was therefore no point in conducting a review of the Mosquito Management Plan when there was a major survey being conducted by consultants. Following this, the recommendations made must be considered by Council to get its views and the Plan amended accordingly. The 'Waterford in Action' community group would then be involved in the Plan review.

Michael O'Brien, Fairview Gardens, Waterford - lived in CoSP for 50 years - grew up in South Perth certainly had no problems back then with mosquitoes - nothing like it is now in Waterford where it is a major problem. Appreciate that the City is doing a lot but obviously it is not working. The suggestion of putting in screening I believe will not work - going down the wrong track - there has to be another solution to the problem.

Les Ozsdolay, Glasnevin Court, Waterford - Question to Dr Neville - Presentation data is responding to 2 years of the effects of the El Nino / La Nina weather patterns whereas we are hearing from people who have lived in Waterford over 10 years stating there has never been anything experienced like that of the last 4 years?

Dr Neville - replied that he did not have an explanation / data etc other than to say there are larger numbers of mosquitoes breeding - it is difficult to obtain this data - we would have to rely on Council records for mosquito trapping information. Important to note we are now gathering that data and using various government agencies to obtain the information. There are more specific triggers we can monitor but at this stage it will take a lot more data-gathering to get that information.

Luciano D'Ambrogio, Waterford Avenue, Waterford - thank the public for their attendance/support. I was involved in the initial setting up of the Mosquito Management Group and spoke about a CLAG two years ago - we needed to be doing a CLAG then but there seems to be a lot of talk and very little action by the City because it is too hard. The Health Department presentation shows Mandurah mosquito numbers went down but ours seem to have gone up - perhaps we can learn something from that. Thank Council for bringing an expert on board - we now have recommendations on the table albeit some have to go to Council for endorsement because of cost implications. In relation to health officers training - apparently it is a 2 week training course and then out in the field, however we have a serious problem and need experienced officers to solve this problem - not only to tell us what to do but how to address it. The problem is we are not hitting all of the sites - realistically ask that we treat all the sites either by aerial application or whatever means available to address the issues.

MINUTES : SPECIAL ELECTORS CALLED TO DISCUSS MOSQUITO MANAGEMENT IN WATERFORD WETLANDS AND SURROUNDING AREAS : 17 JANUARY 2012

CEO - I acknowledge that the City is not a member of a CLAG. At the time that it was first discussed the Department of Health required particular instances of complaints or nuisance to be registered before they could participate in a CLAG however the Health Department has now changed its practice - as a result of this we may join with the Town of Victoria Park and the City of Belmont in this regard. In relation to the reduction in mosquito trapping information in Mandurah compared to South Perth, as a result of 15 aerial applications, this is only in Mandurah and for the most recent reading. The average cost of aerial treatments over Waterford would be about \$15,000 per treatment - any funding required that is not budgeted for requires us to seek Council approval.

Dr Neville - stated we (the Health Department of Western Australia) pay for the helicopter treatments around Mandurah but only in high risk areas and we do not pay for any helicopter services in metropolitan zones due to potential harm and the associated legal issues.

CEO further stated that Council always takes advice and said that the comment we are 'not hitting all sites' is because we cannot fog over the river (banned by the Swan River Trust) and to get lavacide in the river can only be done by air or boat. The chemical lavacide should not be carried in a boat which then leaves only the aerial solution. He said that all the recommendations would be considered in a report to the February 2012 Meeting of Council.

John Salapak, Carlow Circle, Waterford - understand Waterford and its environment however for the last 4 years the problem has become unbearable and it is now an intolerable situation. Despite increased fogging/spraying etc only 25% of the sites are actually accessible and that is the problem. I acknowledge the recommendation in relation to helicopter spraying is an expensive option but we are talking about a quality of life here. Have paid rates towards infrastructure whereas the roads are put in by developers - believe we are paying a high price for a quality of life - now time for action.

Kaydyn Tutt, Tralee Way, Waterford - thank Chris McMullen for organising Petition. I'm fed up with the problem and being harassed by mossies. If Councillors do not care about people that is fine but what about property prices in Waterford - do not want property titles marked as 'mosquito problem area'.

Terry Ilich, Cabra Place, Waterford - heard Department of Health say that the statement 'mosquito prone area' is listed on property titles - believe this is an excuse by the Department to now have Waterford declared a mosquito problem area which is unacceptable - the problem needs to be fixed it was not a problem 4 years ago - not right our titles should be listed as a 'mosquito prone area'.

Daryl Calligaro, Waterford Avenue, Waterford - as a sign of good faith to ratepayers, ask that in the next Budget, resources be allocated to provide protection against this mosquito problem for residents in the Waterford area. I disagree that Council has been pro-active - they have been dragged into doing something as the problem over the last 4/5 years has been increasing - better results now need to be achieved.

Peter Fry, Nenagh Grove, Waterford - the City of Canning have a fogging machine - their environmental health officers are fogging properly and achieving results.

Ryan Valente, Nenagh Grove, Waterford - at the last Mosquito Management meeting representatives from the Health Department presented a chart about mossies/issues etc - now we have a situation where we are told it is an environmental problem creating the increased breeding and are being asked to put a net (barrier treatment) around us and leave the mossies alone - address the issue!

MINUTES : SPECIAL ELECTORS CALLED TO DISCUSS MOSQUITO MANAGEMENT IN WATERFORD WETLANDS AND SURROUNDING AREAS : 17 JANUARY 2012

Peter Best, Mary Street, Como - recognise the mosquito problem, recognise we want action, recognise work that has been done and work that continues to be done. In the 1930s we saw Mosquito fish introduced to address the problem - in the 1940s part of Canning river was dammed - stopped river flow and river then became salt - did not fix the problem - the history is not good in stopping the mosquito problem. We would like to see something happen - this is much more than a local problem - research shows it is a global problem. Fogging has been suggested but does not necessarily give us the solution we want - has related health issues. Hope from this meeting we have good community consultation and ask Councillors to act with care.

Chris McMullen, Petitioner - made a closing address summing up his concerns and moving the following Motions:

**MOTION 1**

Moved Chris McMullen, Sec Jacqueline Valente, Nenagh Grove, Waterford

That the draft 2011/2012 Mosquito Management Plan **not** be accepted by Council until the Expert's Recommendations are addressed.

The Mayor Put the Motion.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

**MOTION 2**

Moved Chris McMullen, Sec Daryl Calligaro

That the City provide sufficient funds in its 2012/2013 Budget to allow the full and complete implementation of all of the Expert's Recommendations throughout the 2012/2013 mosquito season (August to as late as May).

The Mayor Put the Motion.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

**MOTION 3**

Moved Chris McMullen, Sec Les Ozsdolay

That the City immediately commence aerial larviciding as recommended by the Expert and continue such program for the remainder of the 2011/12 season.

The Mayor Put the Motion.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

**MOTION 4**

Moved Chris McMullen, Sec Luciano D'Ambrogio

That until the City Administration can reliably identify and treat all breeding spots, it shall:

- conduct fogging when thresholds are exceeded (as per original plan); and
- measure the effects of the fogging immediately and repeat fogging / measurements if still necessary.

The Mayor Put the Motion

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

***Where to from Here***

This matter will be the subject of report to the February 2012 meeting of Council.

**6. CLOSURE**

The Mayor thanked everyone for their attendance and input and closed the meeting at 9.45pm

**MINUTES : SPECIAL ELECTORS CALLED TO DISCUSS MOSQUITO MANAGEMENT IN  
WATERFORD WETLANDS AND SURROUNDING AREAS : 17 JANUARY 2012**

**These Minutes were confirmed at a meeting on 28 February 2012**

**Signed \_\_\_\_\_  
Chairperson at the meeting at which the Minutes were confirmed.**